

# Indoor Air Quality and Sick Building Syndrome Study at Two Selected Libraries in Johor Bahru, Malaysia

Z. Sulaiman and M. Mohamed

Faculty of Chemical Engineering, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, 81310 UTM Skudai, Johor, Malaysia

#### Abstract

This study was carried out to investigate the association between sick building syndrome (SBS) and indoor air pollutants in two libraries. 101 workers in both libraries responded to the questionnaire, which was based on Malaysian Industry Code of Practice on Indoor Air Quality 2010 (MCPIAQ) for the measurement of SBS occurrences. Measurements of indoor air quality were also performed according to the MCPIAQ methods. Higher prevalence of SBS recorded in Perpustakaan Sultanah Zanariah (PSZ), Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, compared to Perpustakaan Sultan Ismail (PSI) ( $X^2 = 38.81$ , p = 0.000), Johor Bahru City. Significantly higher levels of indoor air pollutants were detected in PSZ compare to PSI for CO, CO<sub>2</sub>, temperature, bacteria, fungi and Total Volatile Organic Compounds (TVOC), while PSI indicated higher level of relative humidity (RH). The levels of CO<sub>2</sub>, temperature, humidity, TVOC and bacteria counts were the possible major factors contributing to SBS complaints among the workers of both libraries.

*Keywords:* Indoor air quality (IAQ); Sick building syndrome (SBS); Carbon dioxide (CO2)

### 1. Introduction

Past research indicated that indoor air quality (IAQ) problems and reports of sick building syndrome (SBS) generally were not caused simply by exposure to poor IAQ, but rather the cases occurred due to the combined effects of various physical environment and non-environmental factors ((Ismail *et al.*, 2004; Joshi, 2008; Zain-Ahmed *et al.*, 2005). IAQ complaints and the SBS are the outcome of complex processes, initiated by a set of stressful multiple risks which create personal strain.

Most studies of IAQ complaints and the SBS have found that there is good evidence that personal, psychological, and occupational variables also affect reports of IAQ complaints and health symptoms (Marmot *et al.*, 2006). Gomzi and Bobic (2009) summarize three sets of factors that appear to be common to most SBS such as building factors, specific environmental factors and pollutants, and personal factors.

SBS complaints are influenced by various nonenvironmental variables, such as personal, occupational, and psychological factors, which can either directly or indirectly alter the stress load on a person, which in turn influences susceptibility and reports of SBS symptoms by individual workers (Pauncu *et al.*, 2001). Psychosocial processes may act directly as stressors, causing symptoms, through psycho-physiological mechanisms. Furthermore, they may render the individual more sensitive to normally tolerated physical and chemical factors in the environment (Ooi *et al.*, 1998).

The current study was designed to investigate which etiological factors were still relevant to reported symptoms within state of the art buildings of modern design, where there was expected to be low prevalence symptoms associated with SBS. This study was collaborative project conducted from March to December 2009 in two libraries in Johor Bahru, Johor, Malaysia with epidemiological study design of the SBS and special agency with focus detailed about occupational hygiene aspects of monitoring indoor environmental conditions and thus provides information of indoor air quality and its association with the SBS prevalence among library workers in two libraries.

### 2. Materials and Methods

To fulfill the objective of the study, the librarian staff was asked to complete a self administered questionnaire to rate their office environment and report the presence or absence of symptoms. This questionnaire is based on Malaysian Industry Code of Practice on Indoor Air Quality 2010 (MCPIAQ).

MCPIAQ was established in 2010. The purpose of this MCPIAQ is to set minimum standards that will protect the health of employees and other occupants of an indoor or enclosed environment served by a common mechanical ventilation and/or air conditioning system.

This MCPIAQ apply to all non-industrial places of work in industries listed under Schedule 1 of the Occupational Safety and Health Act 1994 (Act 514).

Field measurements at both libraries were conducted in the period between March and December 2009. Samplings were carried out once in a day in the morning (10:30 am - 1:00 pm) and then continued during the afternoon (2:00 pm-4:30 pm).

There were different numbers of sampling location for each library with 23 sampling locations Perpustakaan Sultanah Zanariah (PSZ), Universiti Teknologi Malaysia and 12 sampling locations for Perpustakaan Sultan Ismail (PSI), Jalan Datin Halimah, Johor Bahru. The selections of these sampling locations were based on MCPIAQ.

This study used a combination of "real time" and long term monitoring of the ambient indoor air. Air quality parameters were measured using several real time instruments (CO<sub>2</sub> and CO monitor, particulate counter, velocity meter, and PID). One measurement per site was taken in the designated sample sites within the breathing zone. The results were then recorded on a data sheet. Table 1 shows the indoor variables investigated, types of analytical instruments used, and their detection limits. Indoor air samples were collected from the breathing zone, about 1.4 metre above the floor, at selected locations within the library premises based on approved methods.

The results from questionnaires and indoor variables were analysed by using the Odd Ratio (OR). The OR is one of a range of statistics used to assess the risk of a particular outcome (or disease) if a certain factor (or exposure) is present. An OR is used to compare the

odds for two groups, in the same way that the relative risk is used to compare risks.

### 2. Results and Discussion

## 2.1. Socio demographic information

Table 2 indicated that 141 individuals or 74.21% responded to the questionnaire. The distribution of the questionnaire for each library shows that 69% and 97% of occupants completed and returned the questionnaire for PSZ and PSI respectively. The result also shows that the distribution base on gender was not consistent.

The characteristics of the respondents are described in Table 3. The occupants of the libraries are 36.7% female and 63.3% male. All libraries mostly occupied by professional, managerial staff, technical and clerical staff. As academic library, PSZ always entertain students during the semesters.

The occupants of the three libraries work for eight hours or more in a day. The occupant's workplace includes a closed office, own cubicle and an open area shared with others. Smoking is prohibited in both libraries.

## 2.2. Comparison of indoor air pollutants in both buildings

The Indoor air quality (IAQ) results found to be generally satisfactory in all libraries except a few parameters were exceeded the standard limits at some sampling locations.

The concentration of CO<sub>2</sub> varies at different

| Table 1. | Indoor | variables | investigated. | analytical | method used. | and their | detection limits |
|----------|--------|-----------|---------------|------------|--------------|-----------|------------------|
|          |        |           |               |            |              |           |                  |

| Variable              | Methods  | Instruments                   | Detection limit            |
|-----------------------|--|-------------------------------|----------------------------|
| Volatile Organic      | Proportional Integral  | Directsense <sup>TM</sup> IAQ | 20-20000 ppb               |
| Compounds             | Derivative (PID)   | Monitor, model IQ-610         | 0-10000 ppm                |
| Carbon Dioxide        |  | from Garywolf                 | 0-500 ppm                  |
| Carbon Monoxide       | Non-dispersive   |                               | 0.1%                       |
| Relative Humidity     | infrared sensor  |                               | -10 +- 70°C                |
| Temperature           |  |                               |                            |
| Air movement          | AS-201   |                               | $0.001-100 \text{ mg/m}^3$ |
| Respirable Suspended  | Portable laser   | $DUSTTRACK^{TM}$              |                            |
| Particulates          | photometer   | Aerosol Monitor model         |                            |
|                       | -  | 8520                          | 0.3 ppm                    |
| Formaldehyde          | Formaldehyde sensor<br>type electrochemical<br>manufactured by PPM | PPM Formaldemeter htv         |                            |
|                       | Technology   |                               | 1 CFU/m <sup>3</sup>       |
| Total bacteria counts | Tryptic soy agar   | SKC Biostage single           | 1 CFU/m <sup>3</sup>       |
| Total fungal counts   | culture  | stage impactor                |                            |
|                       | Potato dextrose agar   |                               |                            |

Table 2. Distribution of questionnaires at PSZ and PSI

| No. | Respondent                         | PSZ (number) | PSI (number) |
|-----|------------------------------------|--------------|--------------|
| 1.  | Occupants/staff                    | 155          | 35           |
|     | a) Distributed questionnaire       | 107          | 34           |
|     | b) Completed the form and returned | 66           | 26           |
|     | - Male                             | 41           | 8            |
|     | - Female                           |              |              |

Table 3. Some personal characteristics of occupants in both libraries

| Characteristics        |          | Occupants of librarie | es          |
|------------------------|----------|-----------------------|-------------|
| Characteristics        | (number) | $X^2$                 | Significant |
| Age (year)             |          | 7.68                  | 0.053       |
| Under 20               | 28       |                       |             |
| 20-29                  | 33       |                       |             |
| 30-39                  | 31       |                       |             |
| above 40               | 49       |                       |             |
| Marital status         |          | 18.44                 | 0.000       |
| Single                 | 45       |                       |             |
| Married                | 96       |                       |             |
| Not answered           | 0        |                       |             |
| Job category           |          | 56.06                 | 0.000       |
| Managerial             | 22       |                       |             |
| Professional           | 20       |                       |             |
| Secretarial            | 6        |                       |             |
| Clerical               | 59       |                       |             |
| Others                 | 34       |                       |             |
| Total year of service  |          | 7.511                 | 0.057       |
| Less than one month    | 28       |                       |             |
| 1-12 month             | 33       |                       |             |
| 1 year-4 years         | 31       |                       |             |
| more than 5 years      | 49       |                       |             |
| Smoking                |          | 101.149               | 0.000       |
| Yes                    | 24       |                       |             |
| No                     | 103      |                       |             |
| Sometimes              | 14       |                       |             |
| Asthma                 |          | 210.255               | 0.000       |
| Yes, on medication     | 2        |                       |             |
| Yes, not on medication | 11       |                       |             |
| No                     | 128      |                       |             |
| Allergy                |          | 180.809               | 0.000       |
| Yes, on medication     | 4        |                       |             |
| Yes, not on medication | 15       |                       |             |
| No                     | 122      |                       |             |
| Migraine               |          | 69.511                | 0.000       |
| Yes, on medication     | 0        |                       |             |
| Yes, not on medication | 21       |                       |             |
| No                     | 120      |                       |             |

<sup>\*</sup>Significant results emboldened

sampling locations in PSZ and PSI ranged from 321 – 1231 ppm. As a whole, the CO<sub>2</sub> levels were acceptable except at Internet area and the lobby at third floor in PSZ UTM. The values exceeded the MCPIAQ and ASHRAE standard recommended value of 1000 ppm for continuous exposure. This suggests that there was a relatively poor distribution of fresh air over the conditioned airspace or that the ventilation rate is insufficient. The area was also relatively crowded. The complaints of stuffiness maybe due to the lack of fresh air to dilute the CO<sub>2</sub>. ASHRAE 62-2007 recommends fresh intake of 20 cfm per person. Unfortunately air change rate or fresh air supply per person are not examined in this study.

CO<sub>2</sub> is a by-product of human respiration. Higher CO<sub>2</sub> is an indicator of the lack of fresh outdoor air. It should be noted that the occurrence of relative high CO<sub>2</sub> level may correlates with areas of stagnant air due to inadequate ventilation i.e. low air change per person or poor ventilation within this area. CO<sub>2</sub> levels above 1000 ppm indicate lack of adequate ventilation which may result in a feeling of "stuffiness" due to built up CO<sub>2</sub>. Elevated levels of CO<sub>2</sub> can cause drowsiness and lowered productivity in most individuals. Some symptoms that occupants and visitors may face with are headache, fatigue, dizziness etc.

High concentrations of air-borne bacteria and fungal were found at some sampling locations of PSZ, namely the third floor, the lobby and Bilik Bantuan Penyelidikan (Research Support Room) on level four of PSZ and the administrative office and the binding room in PSI. Microorganisms found in the air are usually originated from soil, water, plants, animals, people or other breathing sources. The nutrients which microbes require to grow are typically found in dust particulates or humid environment which includes human skin flakes and other dead or decaying biological materials.

The ambient temperatures in both libraries ranged from 19.4-32°C with a mean of 24.53°C (median: 24.1°C). Average relative humidity was from 41.6-71.2% with a mean of 62.19 (median: 62.1%). Table 5 lists the concentrations found for the different substances investigated. Respirable Suspended Particulates (RSP) was measured with a mean concentration of 0.04 mg/m³ and a wide range of values (0.002-0.12 mg/m³). Concentration measured for Formaldehyde ranged from 0 to 0.19 mg/m³ with a mean value of 0.04 mg/m³ (median: 0.04 mg/m³). Some results at a few locations were above the acceptable indoor concentration of 0.1 ppm (MCPIAQ and ASHRAE). This contaminant is emitted mainly from insulation materials. High

Table 4. Levels of parameters detected in PSZ and PSI (in bracket)

| Parameters                           | Mean    | Median  | Average        | Standard Deviation |
|--------------------------------------|---------|---------|----------------|--------------------|
| Carbon Monoxide                      | 0.66    | 0.625   | 0 - 2.4        | 0.458              |
| (ppm)                                | (0.61)  | (0.550) | (0-1.5)        | (0.430)            |
| Carbon Dioxide                       | 685     | 671     | 321 - 1231     | 188                |
| (ppm)                                | (505)   | (490)   | (393-887)      | (105)              |
| Relative Humidity                    | 62.19   | 62.1    | 41.6 - 71.25   | 5.136              |
| (%)                                  | (66.59) | (67.5)  | (52.4-79.9)    | (5.29)             |
| Temperature                          | 24.53   | 24.1    | 19.4 - 32      | 1.63               |
| (C)                                  | (24.56) | (24.4)  | (21.2-28.9)    | (1.58)             |
| Bacteria                             | 338     | 292     | 53 – 1431      | 236                |
| $(CFU/m^3)$                          | (399)   | (406)   | (53-1113)      | 179                |
| Fungus                               | 243     | 247     | 18 - 892       | 165                |
| $(CFU/m^3)$                          | (217)   | (194)   | (53-512)       | (115)              |
| Total Volatile Organic<br>Compound   | 0.74    | 0.70    | 0.08 - 1.9     | 0.373              |
| (ppm)                                | (0.77)  | (0.75)  | (0.25-1.68)    | (0.253)            |
| Respirable Suspended<br>Particulates | 0.036   | 0.024   | 0.002 - 0.12   | 0.03               |
| $(mg/m^3)$                           | (0.030) | (0.020) | (0.011 - 0.09) | (0.02)             |
| Formaldehyde                         | 0.04    | 0.04    | 0 - 0.19       | 0.029              |
| $(mg/m^3)$                           | (0.05)  | (0.04)  | (0-0.14)       | (0.020)            |
| Air movement                         | 0.12    | 0.08    | 0.01 - 1.2     | 0.18               |
| (m/s)                                | (0.14)  | (0.09)  | (0.01-0.62)    | (0.15)             |

concentrations of formaldehyde can lead to eye irritation. Total VOCs values indicated concentrations ranging from 0.08 to 1.9 mg/m<sup>3</sup>.

## 2.3. Prevalence of Sick Building Syndrome

The score of the SBS was carried out according to the positive response, if one symptom recorded nearly everyday, the mark given was one, according to the SBS scale. If two symptoms were reported everyday, two points were given and so on (Ooi *et al.*, 1998; Syazwan *et al.*, 2009). As shown in Table 5, the number of occupants that had been categorized as having SBS using the above criteria, PSZ workers recorded 57.94% of the workers complained of having SBS, compared to 32.35% of the workers in PSI.

Indoor Air Quality (IAQ) measurements were conducted and the results indicated that there were significant association between the levels of IAQ and SBS (Table 6). Indoor air parameters (CO, CO<sub>2</sub>, Relative Humidity (RH), Temperature, Bacteria, Fungus, Total Volatile Organic Compounds (TVOC), Respirable Suspended Particulates (RSP), Formaldehyde (HCHO) and air movement) were categorized into high concentrations (High) and low concentrations (Low) depending on the median value, either above or lower. Based on Table 6, the results indicated there were significant associations between SBS and Indoor air parameters namely CO, CO2, RH, Temperature, Bacteria, Fungus and TVOC. Based on the results, the adjusted Odd Ratio/risk condition (OR) was calculated for same parameters with the SBS prevalence (Table 6). The OR was adjusted for age, medical conditions, the smoking habit and pregnancy. Table 7 indicated that the factors that significantly influenced the SBS and pollutant concentration were CO2, RH, Temperature and Bacteria.

As be mentioned earlier, CO<sub>2</sub> concentration is a key parameter for assessing IAQ. A clear association is seen between the elevated indoor CO<sub>2</sub> levels and increases in certain SBS symptoms. Analyses conducted using average and median concentrations of indoor

CO<sub>2</sub> had similar findings with previous study (Ooi et al., 1998; Syazwan et al., 2009). The reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> could be done through large increases in ventilation rates, improved effectiveness in providing fresh air to occupant's breathing zone (Seppanen et al., 1999), or through identification of the symptom-causing agents in the indoor air and control their sources. The ventilation that inadequate and insufficient fresh air intake can contribute to high level of CO<sub>2</sub> in certain area in the building (Ooi et al., 1998; Syazwan et al., 2009). The low intake of fresh air will also influence the indoor temperature value in the building. Similar conclusion were observed in the study conducted by Bayer et al. (1990) who stated that the SBS may occur due to inadequate ventilation and high level of humidity and temperature.

Both libraries recorded significantly higher all indoor climatic measured except for RSP, HCHO and air movement. However, in general all the indoor pollutant measures were below MCPIAQ limits and this indicate that the mechanical ventilation airconditioners (MVAC) were well-maintained in both libraries.

Other parameters, which influence SBS were CO, Fungus and TVOC. In this study, after adjusting the confounder it was shown that the SBS was not influencing this parameters. As mentioned earlier CO exposure in this study was low and below maximum limits (MCPIAQ, 2005). CO concentration in both libraries were recorded slightly similar with the previous study conducted by Gul et al. (2007) and Syazwan et al. (2009), who stated that the concentration of CO was low at the range 0.01 to 3 ppm. The concentration of CO in previous study conducted by Jonathan et al. (2001) stated that the CO level more than 10 ppm was observed due to the outdoor source especially from the parking lot. The CO concentration above 10 ppm was significantly associated with SBS symptoms such as dizziness, fatigue and headache (Samet, 1993).

The results of the indoor air pollutants and SBS comparison indicated that the most significant pollutants that influenced SBS were CO, CO<sub>2</sub>, RH, Temperature,

Table 5. Comparison of the prevalence of SBS in the workers of PSZ and PSI libraries

| Variables |            | ce of SBS<br>1(100%) | $X^2$  | p     |
|-----------|------------|----------------------|--------|-------|
|           | Yes        | No                   |        |       |
| PSZ       | 62 (57.94) | 45 (42.06)           | 37.794 | 0.000 |
| PSI       | 11 (32.35) | 23 (67.65)           |        |       |

Significant at p < 0.05, N = 141

Table 6. Association between SBS and pollutant levels (PSZ vs PSI)

|              | D (                   |        |      | BS<br>1 (100%) |      |            |       |      |       |       | 050    | / CI  |
|--------------|-----------------------|--------|------|----------------|------|------------|-------|------|-------|-------|--------|-------|
| Parameter    | Parameter<br>Category | Yes    |      | No             |      | OR In (OR) |       |      |       |       | 95% CI |       |
|              |                       | n = 73 | %    | n = 68         | %    |            |       |      |       |       |        | lower |
| Co           | High                  | 34     | 46.6 | 20             | 29.3 | 2.1        | 0.74  | 0.70 | 1.43  | 0.04  | 4.19   | 1.01  |
|              | Low                   | 39     | 53.4 | 48             | 70.3 |            |       |      |       |       |        |       |
| $Co_2$       | High                  | 48     | 65.8 | 25             | 36.6 | 3.3        | 1.19  | 0.69 | 1.89  | 0.50  | 6.59   | 1.66  |
|              | Low                   | 25     | 34.2 | 43             | 63.4 |            |       |      |       |       |        |       |
| RH           | High                  | 44     | 60.3 | 25             | 36.8 | 2.6        | 0.96  | 0.68 | 1.64  | 0.28  | 5.15   | 1.32  |
|              | Low                   | 29     | 39.7 | 43             | 63.2 |            |       |      |       |       |        |       |
| Temperature  | High                  | 38     | 52.1 | 19             | 27.9 | 2.8        | 1.03  | 0.70 | 1.73  | 0.33  | 5.64   | 1.39  |
|              | Low                   | 35     | 47.9 | 49             | 72.1 |            |       |      |       |       |        |       |
| Bacteria     | High                  | 35     | 47.9 | 23             | 33.8 | 1.8        | 0.59  | 0.68 | 1.27  | -0.09 | 3.56   | 0.91  |
|              | Low                   | 38     | 52.1 | 45             | 66.2 |            |       |      |       |       |        |       |
| Fungus       | High                  | 40     | 54.8 | 22             | 32.4 | 2.5        | 0.93  | 0.69 | 1.62  | 0.24  | 5.03   | 1.28  |
|              | Low                   | 33     | 45.2 | 46             | 67.6 |            |       |      |       |       |        |       |
| TVOC         | High                  | 32     | 30.5 | 16             | 23.5 | 2.5        | 0.93  | 0.73 | 1.66  | 0.20  | 5.24   | 1.23  |
|              | Low                   | 41     | 56.2 | 52             | 76.5 |            |       |      |       |       |        |       |
| RSP          | High                  | 23     | 31.5 | 35             | 51.5 | 0.4        | -0.84 | 0.69 | -0.15 | -1.52 | 0.86   | 0.22  |
|              | Low                   | 50     | 68.5 | 33             | 48.5 |            |       |      |       |       |        |       |
| НСНО         | High                  | 21     | 28.8 | 37             | 54.4 | 0.3        | -1.08 | 0.70 | -0.39 | -1.78 | 0.68   | 0.17  |
|              | Low                   | 52     | 71.2 | 31             | 45.6 |            |       |      |       |       |        |       |
| Air movement | High                  | 19     | 26.0 | 19             | 27.9 | 0.9        | -0.10 | 0.74 | 0.65  | -0.84 | 1.91   | 0.43  |
|              | Low                   | 54     | 74.0 | 49             | 72.1 |            |       |      |       |       |        |       |

OR significant at 95% CI > 1, N = 141

Bacteria, Fungus and TVOC (OR = 3.3, 95% CI = 1.66-6.59). Increasing the level of  $CO_2$  in each building has shown positive association to the occurrences of SBS thus caused the increase in certain lower respiratory diseases (Michael *et al.*, 2000).

TVOC has shown significant association with SBS prevalence (OR = 2.5, 95% CI = 1.23 - 5.24). The respondents recorded having SBS for when the level of TVOC was at 30.5%. There was a trend whereby the workers have SBS symptoms such as headache, fatigue and dizziness associated with the TVOC exposure

of more than 3 ppm (Runeson *et al.*, 2003). RH also significant association with the SBS prevalence (OR = 2.6, 95% CI = 1.32-5.15). High humidity levels in the indoor environment can cause the sensation of dryness by respondents (Fang *et al.*, 2004)

After adjusting for confounding, we found important and statistically significant associations of SBS symptoms was the increases of Bacteria (OR = 1.0, 95% CI = 0.43-2.17). As mentioned earlier, high levels of bacteria exposure will cause allergic reactions and infectious diseases.

Table 7. Association between SBS and pollutant levels (PSZ vs PSI) before and after controlling confounders

|                 | Parameter | SBS before adjust<br>N = 141 (100%) |      |        |      | OR          |        | *OR  |        |      |             |
|-----------------|-----------|-------------------------------------|------|--------|------|-------------|--------|------|--------|------|-------------|
| Parameter       | Category  | Yes                                 |      | No     |      | (95% CI)    | Yes    |      | No     |      | 95% CI      |
|                 |           | n = 73                              | %    | n = 68 | %    |             | n = 63 | %    | n = 38 | %    |             |
| Со              | High      | 34                                  | 46.6 | 20     | 29.3 | 2.1         | 22     | 34.9 | 18     | 47.4 | 0.6         |
|                 | Low       | 39                                  | 53.4 | 48     | 70.3 | (1.04-4.19) | 41     | 65.1 | 20     | 52.6 | (0.26-1.35) |
| Co <sub>2</sub> | High      | 48                                  | 65.8 | 25     | 36.6 | 3.3         | 39     | 61.9 | 16     | 42.1 | 2.2         |
|                 | Low       | 25                                  | 34.2 | 43     | 63.4 | (1.66-6.59) | 24     | 38.1 | 22     | 57.9 | (0.98-5.08) |
| RH              | High      | 44                                  | 60.3 | 25     | 36.8 | 2.6         | 37     | 58.7 | 21     | 55.3 | 1.2         |
|                 | Low       | 29                                  | 39.7 | 43     | 63.2 | (1.32-5.15) | 26     | 41.3 | 17     | 44.7 | (051-2.60)  |
| Temperature     | High      | 38                                  | 52.1 | 19     | 27.9 | 2.8         | 33     | 52.4 | 19     | 50.0 | 1.1         |
|                 | Low       | 35                                  | 47.9 | 49     | 72.1 | (1.39-5.64) | 30     | 47.6 | 19     | 50.0 | (0.49-2.46) |
| Bacteria        | High      | 35                                  | 47.9 | 23     | 33.8 | 1.8         | 31     | 49.2 | 19     | 50.0 | 1.0         |
|                 | Low       | 38                                  | 52.1 | 45     | 66.2 | (0.91-3.56) | 32     | 50.8 | 19     | 50.0 | (0.43-2.17) |
| Fungus          | High      | 40                                  | 54.8 | 22     | 32.4 | 2.5         | 32     | 50.8 | 22     | 57.9 | 0.8         |
|                 | Low       | 33                                  | 45.2 | 46     | 67.6 | (1.28-5.03) | 31     | 49.2 | 16     | 42.1 | (0.33-1.69) |
| TVOC            | High      | 32                                  | 30.5 | 16     | 23.5 | 2.5         | 22     | 34.9 | 16     | 42.1 | 0.7         |
|                 | Low       | 41                                  | 56.2 | 52     | 76.5 | (1.23-5.24) | 41     | 65.1 | 22     | 57.9 | (0.32-1.69) |
| RSP             | High      | 23                                  | 31.5 | 35     | 51.5 | 0.4         | 13     | 20.6 | 35     | 92.1 | 0.0         |
|                 | Low       | 50                                  | 68.5 | 33     | 48.5 | (0.22-0.86) | 50     | 79.4 | 3      | 7.9  | (0.01-0.08) |
| НСНО            | High      | 21                                  | 28.8 | 37     | 54.4 | 0.3         | 11     | 17.5 | 37     | 97.4 | 0.0         |
|                 | Low       | 52                                  | 71.2 | 31     | 45.6 | (0.17-0.68) | 52     | 82.5 | 1      | 2.6  | (0.00-0.05) |
| Air movement    | High      | 19                                  | 26.0 | 19     | 27.9 | 0.9         | 9      | 14.3 | 19     | 50.0 | 0.2         |
|                 | Low       | 54                                  | 74.0 | 49     | 72.1 | (0.43-1.91) | 54     | 85.7 | 19     | 50.0 | (0.06-0.43) |

OR significant at 95% CI > 1, N = 141

## 4. Conclusion

There is no direct causal link between exposure to CO<sub>2</sub> and SBS symptoms, but rather the levels CO<sub>2</sub> has a strong correlation with other indoor pollutants that may cause SBS symptoms. At the same time, it was found that temperature, humidity, TVOC and Bacteria are important indoor air factors that can influence the prevalence of SBS.

## Acknowledgements

The authors are grateful to the Department Occupational

Safety and Health Malaysia and the Culture Laboratory, Department of Bioscience, Faculty of Bioscience and Bioengineering, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia for their assistance in the study.

### References

Act 514, Occupational Safety Health Act 1994.

ASHRAE, Ventilation for Acceptable Indoor Air Quality. (ASHRAE Standard 62-2007) American Society of Heating, Refrigerating and Air-Conditioning Engineers, Inc. (ASHRAE), Atlanta, USA, 2007

Bayer CW. Maintaining optimum indoor air quality, Journal Property Management 1990; 55: 37-39.

- Fang L, Wyon DP, Clausen G, Fanger PO. Impact of indoor air temperature and humidity in an office on perceived air quality, SBS symptoms and performance, Indoor Air 14 (Suppl 7) 2004; 74-81.
- Gomzi M, Bobic J. Sick Building Syndrome: Do we live and work in healthy environment? Periodicum Biologorum 2009; 111(1): 79-84.
- Gul H, Issever H, Ayraz O, Gungor G. Occupational and Environmental Risk Factors for the Sick Building Syndrome in Modern Offices in Istanbul: A Cross Sectional Study. Indoor and Built Environment 2007; 16(1): 47-54.
- Ismail AR, Jusoh N, Sopian K, Usman IMS, Zulkifli R, Rahman MNA. Thermal comfort assessment: A study at Malaysia car manufacturer, European Journal of Scientific Research 2004; 27(4): 510-23.
- Jonathan M, Honer A. Survey of carbon monoxide in student rened flats in London, UK, Environmental Management and Health 2001; 12(4).
- Joshi SM. The sick building syndrome. Indian Journal of Occupational & Environment Medicine 2008; 12(2): 61-64.
- Malaysia Industry Code of Practice on Indoor Air Quality 2010, Published by Dept. of Occupational Safety and Health Malaysia.
- Marmot AF, Stafford EN, Stanfied SA, Warwick E, Marmot MG. Building Health: an epidemiological study of "sick building syndrome" in the Whitehall II study. Occupational and Environmental Medicine 2006; 63: 283-89
- Michael GA, William JF, Joan MD. Indoor Air Carbon Dioxide Concentration and SBS in Office workers. Proceedings of Healthy Buildings 2000; 1.
- Ooi PL, Goh KT, Phoon MH, Foo SC, Yap HM. Epidemiology of sick Building syndrome and its associated resk factors in Singapore; Occupational Environment Medicine 1998; 55: 188-95.
- Pauncu EA, Sirb L, Oros C, Fernolendt M, Papoe G, Bocsa M, Georgescu L. "Sick Building Syndrome" In Actuality. The Journal of Preventive Medicine 2001; 9(4): 71-77.
- Samet JM. Indoor air pollution: a public health perspective. Proceeding of the 6th International Conference on Indoor Air Quality. Helsinki: International Conference on Indoor Air Quality 1993; 1: 3-12.
- Seppanen OA, Fisk WJ, Mendell MJ. Association ventilation rates and CO2 concentration with health and other responses in commercial and institutional buildings. Indoor Air 1999; 9: 226-52.
- Syazwan AI, Juliana J, Norhafizalina O, Azman ZA, Kamaruzaman J. Indoor air quality and sick building syndrome in Malaysian Buildings, Global Journal of Science 2009; 1(2): 126-35.
- Zain-Ahmed A, Rahman SA, Shahrani S. Natural cooling and ventilation and contemporary residential homes in Malaysia: Impact on indoor thermal comfort. The 2005 World Sustainable Building Conference, Tokyo, 27-29 September 2005 (SB05 Tokyo).

Received 30 November 2010 Accepted 28 December 2010

### Correspondence to

Zulkifly Sulaiman Faculty of Chemical Engineering, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, 81310 UTM Skudai, Johor, Malaysia

Tel: 07 2249039, Fax: 07 2242667

E-mail: Zulkifly\_S@mohr.gov.my